

## OFFICE OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL

STATE OF ILLINOIS

Jim Ryan
ATTORNEY GENERAL

December 4, 2000

VIA HAND DELIVERY

Chairman Richard L. Mathias Illinois Commerce Commission 160 N. LaSalle Street, C-800 Chicago, Illinois 60601

Commissioner Terry S. Harvill Illinois Commerce Commission 160 N. LaSalle Street, C-800 Chicago, Illinois 60601

Commissioner Mary Frances Squires Illinois Commerce Commission 160 N. LaSalle Street, C-800 Chicago, IL 60601 Commissioner Ruth K. Kretschmer Illinois Commerce Commission 160 N. LaSalle Street, C-800 Chicago, Illinois 60601

Commissioner Edward C. Hurley Illinois Commerce Commission 160 N. LaSalle Street, C-800 Chicago, Illinois 60601 DEC 5 9 50 M '00

RE: Illinois Commerce Commission Docket No. 00-0361 Letter of Commonwealth Edison to Commission, dated November 29, 2000

## Dear Commissioners:

Last Thursday the Attorney General's office received a copy of a letter from Commonwealth Edison addressed to the Commission, in which ComEd indicated that it was in agreement with the Commission's suggestion, made at its November 20<sup>th</sup> pre-bench meeting, that ComEd "donate" certain nuclear plant station sites to the State of Illinois as a condition to Commission approval of the company's decommissioning petition in Docket No. 00-0361. The Citizens Utility Board sent a response to that letter to the Commission on November 30<sup>th</sup>, objecting to the Commission's consideration of such a proposal, at least outside of the evidentiary record.

ICC Commissioners December 4, 2000 Page 2

We harbor serious reservations regarding the *ex parte* nature of the land donation issue outlined in ComEd's letter. As the Commission is well aware, pursuant to Section 10-103 of the Illinois Public Utilities Act, any of its findings with respect to ComEd's petition must be made "...exclusively on the record for decision in the case." 220 ILCS 5/10-103. Neither Illinois law nor the Commission's own rules permit extra-record proposals, even if based upon Commission deliberations at an open meeting, to be the basis for any findings of fact contained in final orders of the Commission. 220 ILCS 5/10-101; 5 ILCS 100/10-35(a)(8); 83 Ill.AdmCode 200.700(a)(10). Moreover, the Act provides that the Commission, having heard evidence on issues formally before it, "...shall make and render findings *concerning the subject matter and facts inquired into and enter its order based thereon.*" At no time was the land donation proposal ever an issue in this docket.

More important, we are compelled to alert the Commission to the fact that this proposal, even if it were not the subject of an *ex parte* communication, raises significant jurisdictional questions. The donation of real property to the state for use as parkland is not within the Commission's jurisdiction. Rather, such a transaction may implicate the authority of the Illinois Department of Natural Resources and in this particular case, the Illinois Department of Nuclear Safety, agencies which would be the likely transferees in such a transaction. The Commission's approval of the transfer of these sites without the participation of necessary parties such as the DNR and the DNS and, indeed, the municipalities involved, would be unprecedented, considering these agencies' overriding interests in land formerly utilized as nuclear plant sites.

If, in light of the above jurisdictional issues, the Commission still decides to consider this "proposal," it may do so only subsequent to a reopening of the record according to its own rules of practice. 83 III.AdmCode 200.870. The record in this proceeding has been marked "heard and taken" and all briefs have been filed. Any party seeking additional hearings must therefore file an application stating its reasons therefore, "...including material changes of fact or of law and...a brief statement of proposed additional evidence and an explanation why such evidence was not previously adduced." 83 III.Adm Code 200.870. Should the Commission conclude that a legal basis for reopening the record exists (and we maintain that neither the facts nor the law support such a reopening at this time), all parties must be provided an opportunity to object to such a request, present their own evidence on the land donation proposal, cross-examine witnesses of other parties and Staff and comment on all duly presented evidence, in accordance with Section 10-101 of the Act. 220 ILCS 5/10-101. Following the close of such rehearing, a proposed order must be issued and the parties have the right to file exceptions to such proposed order. 220 ILCS 5/10-111.

We will not, and indeed, as a matter of law, cannot engage in any evaluation of the substantive proposals contained in ComEd's letter at this time. The General Assembly has enacted the laws cited above to protect the interests of all parties, including the Commission, in

ICC Commissioners December 4, 2000 Page 3

regulatory proceedings. The *ex parte* restrictions contained in the Act serve not only to protect the due process concerns of interested parties, but also to ensure that legal and evidentiary bases for the Commission's final decision exist in the event of legal challenges before a reviewing court.<sup>1</sup>

For all the reasons explained above, we object to the Commission's consideration of the proposal contained in Commonwealth Edison's November 29<sup>th</sup> letter in its forthcoming deliberations on Docket No. 00-0361. We also urge the Commission to disregard any extrarecord proposals in this case without following the appropriate procedural requirements as set forth in the Public Utilities Act and in its own rules of practice.

Sincerely,

Janice A. Dale, Chief Public Utilities Bureau

cc: Attached Service List

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> In accordance with the Illinois Public Utilities Act and the Illinois Commerce Commission's rules of practice, this letter is being filed with the Chief Clerk's Office and served upon all parties of record.

## SERVICE LIST ICC DOCKET NO. 00-0361

John Feeley Office of General Counsel Illinois Commerce Commission 160 North La Salle Street C-800 Chicago, Illinois 60601-3104

Robert C. Feldmeier Attorney For Commonwealth Edison Company Hopkins & Sutter Three First National Plaza Suite 4100 Chicago, Illinois 60602

Robert Garcia Illinois Commerce Commission 160 North La Salle Street C-800 Chicago, Illinois 60601-3104

Paul F. Hanzlik
Attorney For Commonwealth Edison Company
Hopkins & Sutter
Three First National Plaza
Suite 4100
Chicago, Illinois 60602

Steven G. Revethis
Office of General Counsel
Illinois Commerce Commission
160 North La Salle Street
C-800
Chicago, Illinois 60601-3104

John L. Rogers III Hopkins & Sutter Three First National Plaza Suite 4100 Chicago, Illinois 60602 David I. Fein Piper, Marbury, Rudnick & Wolfe 203 North La Salle Street Suite 1800 Chicago, Illinois 60601-1293

Ronald D. Jolly
Assistant Corporation Counsel
City of Chicago
30 North La Salle Street
Suite 900
Chicago, Illinois 60602

Eric Robertson Lueders, Robertson, & Konzen 1939 Delmar Avenue P. O. Box 735 Granite City, Illinois 62040

Alan Pregozen
Illinois Commerce Commission
527 East Capitol Avenue
Springfield, Illinois 62701

Susan M. Landwehr Director, Government Affairs Enron Energy Services, Inc. 900 Second South Avenue Minneapolis, MN 55402

Daniel W. Rosenblum Environmental Law & Policy Center 35 East Wacker Drive Suite 1300 Chicago, Illinois 60601

LeiJuana Doss/Marie Spicuzza
Environmental & Energy Division
Cook County State's Attorney's Office
69 West Washington Street
Suite 700
Chicago, Illinois 60602

Karen M. Norington 208 South La Salle Street Suite 1760 Chicago, Illinois 60604

Rebecca J. Lauer Deputy General Counsel P.O. Box 767 Chicago, Illinois 60690

Sherman Elliott Illinois Commerce Commission 527 East Capitol Avenue Springfield, Illinois 62701

Edward C. Fitzhenry Lueders, Robertson, & Konzen 1939 Delmar Avenue P. O. Box 735 Granite City, Illinois 62040

Randall Robertson Lueders, Robertson & Konzen 1939 Delmar Avenue P. O. Box 735 Granite City, Illinois 62040

Terrance Hillard Hearing Examiner Illinois Commerce Commission 160 North La Salle Street C-800 Chicago, Illinois 60601-3104

Phillip A. Casey
Hearing Examiner
Illinois Commerce Commission
160 North La Salle Street
C-800
Chicago, Illinois 60601-3104

David Borden
Illinois Commerce Commission
160 North La Salle Street
C-800
Chicago, Illinois 60601-3104

Julie Hextell NewEnergy Midwest L. L. C. 309 West Washington, Ste 1100 Chicago, Illinois 60603

Christopher J. Townsend Atty. For Intervenors Piper, Marbury, Rudnick & Wolfe 203 North La Salle Street Suite 1800 Chicago, Illinois 60601-1293

Alan H. Neff
Assistant Corporation Counsel
City of Chicago
30 North La Salle Street
Suite 900
Chicago, Illinois 60602

Conrad Reddick Assistant Corporation Counsel City of Chicago 30 North La Salle Street Suite 900 Chicago, Illinois 60602